

## **Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga in Ubud Bali, Indonesia**

**I Wayan Suyanta**

Doctorate Candidate, Nonformal Education Studies, Post Graduate Program,  
State University of Malang, Jl Semarang No 4 Malang, East Java, Indonesia

**Muhadjir Effendy**

Minister of Education and Culture of Indonesia

Professor, Nonformal Education Studies, Post Graduate Program,  
State University of Malang, Jl Semarang No 4 Malang, East Java, Indonesia

**S.Mundzir**

Professor, Nonformal Education Studies, Post Graduate Program,  
State University of Malang, Jl Semarang No 4 Malang, East Java, Indonesia

**Hardika**

Vice Dean, Faculty of Education Science, State University of Malang  
Lecturer, Nonformal Education Studies, Post Graduate Program,  
State University of Malang, Jl Semarang No 4 Malang, East Java, Indonesia

### **Abstract:**

This research was aimed at finding learning outcomes of Yoga Training. It was driven by the high motivation of the overseas tourists learning Yoga in Bali. Such Yoga learning phenomenon obviously raised learning motivation in an informal Yoga teaching model which was theoretically implemented through learning internalization. This research used the combination of phenomenological and anthropological qualitative approach. Data were collected by using observation and interview. Subjects were teachers and Yoga Learners from overseas consisting of eleven females and two males aged 35-63 years various yoga programs in 9 different types of yoga. This research revealed that outcomes of Yoga training oriented to the self-knowledge reflection were: (1) personality forming (true self); (2) humility; (3) self-transformation; (4) constant learning. This concluded the ultimate learning outcome as forming the spiritual humanistic personality.

### **Keywords:**

Learning outcomes; Yoga tour, Non-formal education, Phenomenology

### **Citation:**

Suyanta, I Wayan; Effendy, Muhadjir; Mundzir S; Hardika (2017); Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga in Ubud Bali, Indonesia; Journal of Social Sciences (COES&RJ-JSS), Vol.6, No.2, pp: 395-412.

### Introduction

Human beings often realize their ideals through self-realization. Alport (1955:7-10) and Littleford (1970:234-235) viewed that human beings are active and individual creature in nature. They have “dynamic internal world” character (Apps, 1979:39), do “search for meaning” (Frankl, 1963:164), and always have “time, symbol, and emotions” behavior (Roger, 1961:122). Even, when there are possibilities they want to learn instantly.

Every individual make efforts to fulfill his human learning need. Generally modern people have experienced almost fatal life turbulence which made them immersed in uncertainty (Jung, 1933:230 and Radhakrishnan, 2013:2). Such situation can be observed from the parts of human lives having unsolved life problems such as being *sad and fragile*. For example, being lonely can make individuals be attributive towards feeling of denial in their social environment (Baron & Byrne, 2004, and Hanurawan, 2010:130). Those who feel to have unstable personality tend to experience stress. Such attribution of feelings make them looked for new environment to ease their *loneliness*.

There have been an obvious development of *the new age movement* which combines western rationality and eastern spiritual mystics (Barbour, 2000:90). This is characteried by the denial of formal religions which is viewed as tending to curb individual freedom. Rederic and MeryAnn Brussat (2009) identify as the spiritual literacy era. In this era people tend to explore expression such as *cult, sect, new thought, new religious movement, human potentials movement, the holistic health movement, and yoga*. Such expression is mostly to reconcile their hearts. The spiritual desire is the specific characteristic of the *New Agers* who practically fall into a *free-flowing spiritual movement*. Sukidi (2000:2) said that “the basic principles believed by the *new agers movement* is that behind the universe there are *universal power, energy, force*. In such situation, challenges are often faced by human beings.

To ease themselves in facing the challenges, individuals look for a humanistic place of learning. Roger (1961:122), Freire (1973:3), and Aloni (2013) explained that there are five characteristics of humanistic education: (i) The holistic approach to the student that seeks to foster and develop their full range of aptitudes, intelligences and literacies; (ii) interpersonal relations based on genuine caring, kindness, reasonableness, fairness and reciprocity; (iii) a social climate of security, trust, acceptance and multiculturalism, together with restrained and tolerant pluralistic behavior; (iv) an intellectual climate that fosters and cultivates breadth of knowledge and cultural wealth along with autonomous, responsible, critical and creative thinking; (v) teaching methods that provide the student with meaningful and experiential learning to render the “*tree of knowledge*”.

Besides, people also look for resting and holiday for travel and tour. Firstly, such desire is only limited for hedonistic style of resting and holiday (Wilson, 2008). Later, it changes into the spiritual tour as for people tend to be spiritual creature (Wilson, 2008). Holladay and Ponder (2012:308) research results provided phenomenon of self-identification through Yoga, touring adventure, and spiritual relationship. They said that the self identification as mostly done by having Yoga and tour adventure. Research in *lake district* in London, tourist imigrated to find eternity within their self-identification. Modern human beings were said to always be occupied by confusion to be independent. They looked for authentic experience as a means of their natural existential revitaliation.

## Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga...

Wilson (2010) argues that spirituality and Yoga are the essence of human beings and the experience and life journey are defined and imbued by spirituality. Travelling has been viewed as a means of spiritual fulfillment (Sharpley & Jepson, 2011). The harmonic consumption attained in the travel can contribute positive input for the tourists prosperity (Ratz, 2008). Furthermore, Cohen (1979) argues that all travels are spiritual and enlarge human perspective of life meaning and purpose, connectedness, and transcendence, including learning Yoga.

According to Cramer (2014:1)

“Worldwide, it is estimated that yoga is regularly practiced by about 30 million people. Yoga is gaining increased popularity as a therapeutic practice; nearly 14 million Americans (6.1% of the United States of America’s population) reported that yoga had been recommended to them by a physician or therapist. Indeed, about half of American yoga practitioners (more than 13 million people) reported starting practice explicitly to improve their health. In the United Kingdom, yoga is even promoted by the National Health Service as a safe and effective approach, in health and illness, for people of all ages”

Fonseca & Mehta, (2012:1) said that

“Millions of people head towards Asia every year to have (beside the travelling experience) an encounter with eastern philosophies and practices which allows for self-healing, self-discovery and self-empowerment. Among alternative medicine systems, therapies, and many other technical systems (including massage, martial arts dance, etc) one of the famous and inspiring subject that attract people to Asia is Yoga”.

The South East Asia including Indonesia has been the destination of overseas tourists. In the 1910s when Indonesia named Batavia, there was the so-called VTV (*Vereeniging Toeristen Verkeer*) or Dutch Tourism Body in Batavia (or Indonesia) (Pitana 2005:35). This as the governmental body taking role as the *tour operator and travel agent* massively promoted Indonesia, especially Java and Bali. In 1926 there was founded a brand called Lisind (*lisonne lindemen*) which was changed into Nitooour (*Nederlandshe Indische Touristen Bureau*) in 1928 as the subsidiary of Dutch Cruise Company (KPM). KPM regularly served cruising connecting Batavia, Surabaya, Bali, dan Makassar (Spillane, 1989; Vickers, 1989; Pitana, 2005:35). Nowadays, the vacation and tour patterns have been different. Bali is an interesting place to visit. This includes the educational tour.

In relation to the educational tour, Sheldon (2015) said that the development of nonformal education need to be studied and analyzed theoretically and comprehensively to contribute benefits for science and human knowledge. The new forms of non formal education also turns out to be the needs of Yoga learning which can guide human beings to comprehend their self-transformation (Mezirow, 1978; Kitchenham, 2008; Moedzakir; 2014:6). According to Raymond (2003:9), the Non-formal education, on the other hand, “takes place mostly outside formal educational systems and is voluntary. It covers a wide variety of learning fields, like youth work, youth clubs, sport associations, voluntary service, training and many other activities that organise learning experiences. It has less clearly framed curricula and much less “certification power”, which gives it a weaker social and financial position. Also, its degree of professionalisation is lower and less strictly defined in comparison with formal education. Formal education is compulsory for the majority of students and must rely on extrinsic learning motivation; non-formal education has the

advantage of being voluntary and can in principle count on the intrinsic motivation of its participants.”

In the cultural diffusion, knowledge of Yoga is enthused by overseas tourist (American and European) who have found that the learning environment and climate in Bali are suitable to the development of Yoga learning. There are no noises of the city. Such situation will highly influence communication and learning Hanurawan (2010:140). Through the tour journey. Tourists can explore the depth of their inside body and mind to attain better insight. Heidegger (1927) analyzes that “human situation is not an isolated individual and then must connect to other people, instead this is an existence of human beings which is needed to find the authentic self-existence” Magee (2001:212). The main needs for this are learning and search inside the body and mind to meet the authenticity.

This research holistically study the outcomes of Yoga learning achieved by the informant and the extended description of the individual experience comprising the physical, emotional, and intellectual experience. The exploration of this research as mainly to find out the layered feelings if the Yoga learning outcomes.

### **Theoretical review**

#### **Conceptual Framework**

Holistically this research analyses non-formal education theories (Freire, 1973; Knowles, 1980; Jarvis, 2004; Roger, 2005; Hoare, 2006; Mundzir, 2010) to work for the analysis of the Yoga learning activities in Ubud and the surroundings. By observing the actualization phenomenon in the field and understanding the meaning of learning by expatriate tourists, this research analyzed phenomenological theory. Among those theories are those by Husserl (1967), Scheler and Weber (1968), Schutz (1972), Ritzer (1992), Berger (1996), Fatchan (2013), and Effendy (2013). Specifically, this research studied the learning internalization phenomenon (Berger and Luckman, 1967; and Barrow, 2010) comprising externalization, objectivity, and internalization. The internalization process of *true self and humility* was subjectively analyzed. The way to explore learning as explored using *transformative learning* (Mezirow, 1991; Dirkx, 2006; Cranton, 2006; Taylor and Cranton, 2012; Moedzakir, 2014; Sathe and Geisler, 2017), as the basis of *adult learning* (Knowles, 1973, 1980) and self transformation in learning Yoga. Other theories used as *continuing education* theories (Apps, 1979; Jarvis, 2005; Haber-Curan and Tillapaugh, 2015). To explore the learning of *8 limb of yoga* seperti this research used theories of Patanjali Yoga Sutra in 400 BC, Vivekananda in 1893, Indra Devi in 1947, that of Cramer, 2014, and that of Jacobsen, 2016 which was done yang *sustainably*.

#### **Non-Formal Education**

Sudjana (1991) describes nonformal education activity as involving “every integrated and systematic action outside the established school system, done independently or which forms important part of a wider activity, is done with the intention to help certain student to reach their learning objective”. Rogers (2005:78) defines nonformal education as “any organized, systematic, educational activity carried on outside the framework of the formal system to provide selected types of learning to particular subgroups in the population, adults as well as children”. On the other hand, Hoare (2006) describes nonformal education as follows:

## Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga...

The concept of non-formal education...was born out of the insufficiencies within and criticism of the formal educational system. The term of NFE became associated with out of school education and was applied to a particular approach to education characterized by greather adaptation to the needs and circumstance of learners, creative use of educational resources, community participation, decentralized and more flexible organization and management, and less authoritarian management and teaching styles.

Mundzir (2010:8) stresses that nonformal education includes adult education, which he classifies as 'popular education', or an education activity which aims to help everyone benefit from their spare time, and use it well and which offers usefull activities and aim to enable them to change or bring variety to their life. In Non-Formal Education there is an adult education classified as a popular education and defined as "educational activities aiming for all people in order to be able to utilize their sparetimes usefully and is aimed at fulfilling their desire to seek life changes and variation (Mundir, 2010:8). These were useful to explore the meaning of learning described by the expatriate tourists for the purpose of this research.

### **Phenomenological Theory of Peter L.Berger dan Lukmann**

The dialectic discussion of Berger dan Luckmann (1899-1959) has relation to the studies of Hegel's thesis, antithesis, and synthesis from which phenomenology of subjective and objective realities can be clearly found out. The Dialectic discussion of Berger and Lukman is then called externalization, objectivity, and internalization.

The understanding of externalization concepts by Berger and Luckmann phenomenology refers to the triangle of externalization, objectivity, and internalization. These are explained by Fatchan (2013:31) as: (a) adaptation of abstract texts which are always becoming references in debates of individual life, (b) adaptation understanding, and (c) social adaptation. In responding phenomenon, individuals usualy debate and discuss by accentuating their own text refferences and test by using several rules and theorem sthngthen their arguments. Such behavior shows the basic of managing operational activities can be related to problems which happen based on the time and place reality. This suits to the the adaptation of contemporary change desire including the understanding of present situation.

Adaptation in community can be a form of imitation to the idols which tend to make individuals behaved like their idols. The social adaptation is based on the individuals' thinking, interpretation, and action. These are related to the institutions they occupy. They directly touch the historical process of their institutional. The externalization process of these individuals involves middle way thingking, compromise, harmony, non-confrontation, social balance, economical balance, political balance, cultural balance, and even the religious balance. These three kinds of the adaptation are becomoing references of the phenomenological researchers to begin with their studies. These concepts of the externalization relate to the analysis of tourists' adaptation in Bali for the purpose of this research. Through the process of introducing travel guide texts, Hinduism value, Bali culture, and Yoga knowledge, the tourists adapt the institutionalization of spiritual Yoga that finally can make them externalizing their adaptation process to the Yoga they did.

Like Berger and Lukmann, Max Scheler also provides his view about Yoga learning behavior done by every tourist always touch at the level of reduction process or ethical

screening. Before occurring the screening, the analysis model developed in this research was identifying cause factors of the Yoga learning behavior. The screening turns out to involve forms of values, norms, and rules of the community. The development of values and ethics must be tightly anticipated by each tourist in order that they get the clear yoga learning behavior. The screening must remain being done due to the differences of ethocs and norms in their own original countries. The tourist migration must remain providing the vies of the target destination values.

### **Objectivity**

Understanding of objectivity is the process of phenomenon foundation existing within human beings which make it as an objective thing. Such phenomenon foundation function as a process of withdrawal process and self meaning. This can be called as self procession to the related social cultural situation and therefore, the objectivity is the self realization at the position of being in the related socio and cultural situation. At this point, there consists of subjective self realization and objective socio cultural environment reality. So, self realization is an absolute concept needed in relation to subjective concept of self and objective concept of the socio cultural environment.

The objectivity explained by experts in modern science, philosophy, and psychology tend to assume human beings as the second place of the materials. Life in general and human beings in specific notion are always interpreted objectively and impersonally. This causes life as a shallow thing. On the other hand, existentialism places human beings in the main position in life and therefore, they are not affraid of instrospection. Existantialism provides the notions of human beings' individuality and personality which against the oppression of subjective humans' special experiences. There are three kinds of objectivity stated by Berger, which are (a) Different Entity Situation, (b) Institutionalization, and Habitualization. The different entity situation is meant as the condition that human beings move in their environment consisting different individuals in the process of objectivity. The environment is the social world as a reality. In this case, dialogues among individuals and the outsiders can provider "new meanings". There will be synchronization of the new meanings and therefore, will cause the meanings integrities which was separated as individual entity before the integration. With such social phenomenon and the demand of external situation, there appears a process of "becoming". It means that there is a meaningful action.

Institutionalization is the awareness building to be action reality. At the level of *meaning contruction* individuals do their action responsibly. They must be aware that they realize what they do, they know the objectives, and they know the meaning. Such meaning process shall be clearly understood. Habituation is the process of making action habit in daily life. At this level, there should not be any interpretation anymore. The analysis model explained by Berger and Lukman related to this process ensures that toruist coming to Bali and having different situation at their countries integrated their new meanings of their own values and values of the places they visisted.

Internaliation is the third process of adaptation explained by Berger and Luckman. This is a process of withdrawal of outside environment in the social life and attract it into the internal situation. This can be called as an identification process. Thus, internaliation can be said as the circumstances when individual can put themselves in the social situation. At

## Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga...

this level there appears classification of social nature based on the understanding, awareness, and identification of each individual.

In line with Berger dan Lukmann, the existentialism phenomenology of Heidegger is a part of the protest against counter-revolutionary movement, both the fascist and communist which tend to destroy individual meaning within the collective mass of social community. As the modern movement, existentialism as prominent in the 20th century. In the 19th century several lonely philosophers such as Kierkegaard and Nietzsche protested them and concerned the human condition or internalization. In the 20th century there as a loud scream to concern the lost of life meaning which as that human beings felt having no different among being at home and out side home.

Based on the analysis model of Berger and Lukmann the assumption studied in this research was the identification process towards of the primary lines of the tourists. The primary socialization of the tourist at the model of religious interpretation within Hindu religion tends to be the traditionalist religion. Referring to the symbolic, ritual, ethic, and philosophical aspects of the Hindu religion. Understanding of the previous texts or the certain idols for example, such as *Vivekananda*, and *Mahatma Gandhi*, will internalize values in terms of Hindu tradition. This will, of course, be different from the interpretation of the modernist. Learning Yoga as the *new age movement* will always follow the new model of modernist family by specializing in the pragmatic Yoga, as for example health, flexibility, restorative, and healing process. Meanwhile, at the secondary line there will be socialization process of Hindu community and the individual of the tourists. For example, the understanding of *Waisnawa* by having the symbol of *U* on the brow and understanding of *Brahma Kumaris* by wearing the white cloths, and others. These two lines can be used as assumption of the internalization in the part of the tourists learning Yoga in Bali.

In the situation of the objectivity and internalization, people will experience transformative learning. Dirks (2006) discusses transformative learning as involving the emotional aspects in learning. The emotional context of the adult people influence their learning process. Such emotional aspects of feeling guilty, being ashamed, being afraid, being afraid of getting lost, and generic anxiety will influence the adult learning process very much. Therefore, educators are obligated to understand such aspects for the success of the learning process.

### Methodology

This research used qualitative approach providing information in terms of words with quality of objectivity and quantity of information Creswell (1998) and Moedzakir (2007:11). This used the phenomenological research design providing pictures of the social phenomenon in terms of words and description (Husserl, 1967; Scheler and Weber, 1968, and Schutz, 1967, Berger, 1994; Ritzer, 1992). The researcher conducted observation, interview, and documentation. The observation involved the participative observation (Spradley, 1980; Faisal, 1995; and Fatchan, 2013:45). The researcher did not participate in talking, instead, he listened, noted, and recorded. In the daily lives of the subjects, the researcher followed the subjects living activities and talking (Talbot, 1997:77; Moscal, 1999:17; Fatchan, 2013:41). In this research, the researcher, for example, noted discussion among the tourists and their instructors as well as discussion among the learners.

Patton (2002) and Boyce (2006:3) suggested In-depth interviewing that involves conducting intensive individual interviews with a small number of respondents to explore their perspectives on a particular idea, program, or situation. For example, we might ask participants, staff, and others associated with a program about their experiences and expectations related to the program, the thoughts they have concerning program operations, processes, and outcomes, and about any changes they perceive in themselves as a result of their involvement in the program. According to Berry (1999) and Preire (2001) such interview is also known as unstructured interviewing which is a type of interview which researchers use to elicit information in order to achieve a holistic understanding of the interviewee's point of view or situation; it can also be used to explore interesting areas for further investigation. This type of interview involves asking informants open-ended questions, and probing wherever necessary to obtain data deemed useful by the researcher. As in-depth interviewing often involves qualitative data, it is also called qualitative interviewing. This research employed indepth interview.

In the qualitative research, the researcher is expected to collect data holistically with multi techniques of data collection. Alverson and Skoldberg (2000: 261-263) as well as Fatchan (2013:57) say that phenomenological qualitative research uses two levels of data which are *primary and secondary data*. Technically such data are noted and recorded at single phase or even at the same times accompanied by indeph interview. This research followed this principles. The validity and reliability of data was measured by the model stated by Fatchan (2013:141) using credinbility standard, triangulation, member check, persistent observation, audit trail, prolonged engagement dan negative case analisis, trasferability standard, dependability standard, and confirmability standard. As suggested by Huberman and Miles (1994) the researcher conducted data reduction and constantly conducted *audit trail* (Fatchan, 2013:62).

Then informants of this research were thirteenth informants eleven females and two males in nine various yoga programs, all Westerners, aged 35-63 years, participating in 9 different types of yoga, and between 3-38 years of yoga practice experience participated in the interviews. Eight of the informants were yoga teachers and five were yoga students. Included in the interviewee teacher group was a healer. Included in the interviewee student group were a homeopath practitioner and a medium. to choose informants, the researcher attended yoga classes in 3 different settings in and around Ubud, Bali observing both the teachers and the students. Teacher informants were chosen based on the yoga information taught. Student informants were picked based on their flexibility and yoga skill levels. Originally researcher planned on using tourist yoga informants, using snowball sampling techniques and mostly expatriate informants were interviewed because of their experience and knowledge of yoga. Thirteen people of the 21 individuals approached agreed to participate as informants. Each informant agreed to their interview being used as data. Questions to informants included items such as how does yoga affect your life? Do you feel there is a relationship between Yoga and your spiritual belief system? If yes, can you explain the relationship? Are you aware that the Yoga learning process is for lifelong learning? Do you believe that yoga learning influences your values in your life? Does yoga learning lead to a greater interest in educational advancement? Has your behaviour changed as a result of yoga learning? What is your method and strategy for learning yoga? Researcher recorded all sessions and then transcribed recordings.

### Results and discussion

#### Shaping Personality (True Self)

A core learning outcome of this subject was a deeper understanding of her true self. So through yoga she discovered the authenticity of her self, and she thought it was miraculous. When she started coming into herself, learning self-reformation, in fact all human beings would like that, and then there was an opening. Really have an experience of the true self. And it also depends on the person's yoga practise. Interviewee MI said: "So I've discovered things about myself that I would've never dreamed possible. I wouldn't have believed you if you told me. And that for me is the miracle of it. When you start coming to the self and you realize that actually all of us would like it too whether or not we unlock it, you know, whether we really experience our truer self."

Someone just needs to focus on the learning of yoga. Someone may need time and perseverance before attaining a better connection with their true self. If one wants to learn about themselves, they need to realize that there are many factors that contribute to their personality, such as the entire history of their life. It's important to be able to accept all aspects of their life. Often times a person is not willing to deal with negative emotions and they try to avoid them, in this way the discovery of the true self will be prolonged. Because of ignorance the true self is not known or not seen. True self is here and true self is always here and we need to allow it to flourish and become stronger. Interviewee MI said:

It's really up to us. We need to be seekers of that. We need to be brave sometimes to get to that. And we have to face a lot of things that we might have been psychologically hiding from and not even realize it. And usually that's the way when we are running from something emotional, we just put up a wall and we just pretend that it's not there. But it's there. It is always there and maybe it's growing and getting stronger through our ignorance of it. (W/02/SY/MI/22042016/H7P2).

For another interviewee, she would like to live in the present moment. In her earlier days, she used to feel that she was moving through stratum of her true self. The subject used to think that if she practiced enough, that she could be anything, but now she realizes that it is not like that. She concluded that now she thinks differently, that she knows who she is, and that she is now purifying herself and living comfortably with her true self. Interviewee TIN stated:

For me, no it's not about learning ideas from the outside; it's about living my dream from the inside when I am more present. And I used to feel like I was evolving through layers of my true self. Like if I did enough practise I would become something, but now I know it's not like that. Now I recognize who I always have been, who I am, and I'm just clearing away everything in the way, and just relaxing and living from my true self here right now. (W/01/GY/TIN/02052016/H5P4).

According to Interviewee IBU, our ideas come from what has happened in our life. She further states that the limbs of yoga have contributed to her becoming a more effective individual especially towards the true self that has occurred from the mirrorization of yoga. Interviewee IBU states:

“In my true self, yes absolutely, I mean I think it’s all like the belief system is also built on experience, it is also built on those pillars of how to become a better person, and that is also reflective in the yoga.” (W/01/SY/IBU/25042016/H7P1).

Through the practice of yoga, the subjects have been able to deepen the understanding of themselves resulting in coherence and inner calm. Interviewee ANA:

“That kind of bringing inside. Because you can reach when you do meditation, when you do breathing techniques, also relaxation, yoga asana practise, and then you are always stretching your self.” Further, she said a yoga process focusing on the nervous system helped her attain wholeness.

Interviewee ANA:

“so you are working on the nervous system, to bring sympathetic nervous system down and switch over into the parasympathetic nervous system, and then you feel the state of coherence of all that.” And she additionally quoted that some people who learn yoga attained the knowledge of true self as Indian philosophers have stated.

She said:

“Here I have trust (pointing at heart), or mindfulness, and then you use the technique, you see first, When you are coherent and this is when the Indians say now you’re back to your true self. This is what they call your true nature, your true self, or your divine self, and this is when you internally find that inner peace, when the vibrations actually coherent with what you really are.”

Another benefit of pranayama yoga is that a person becomes more focussed.

“And you’re really meeting that, why I can perceive that you’re pulled out of yourself, your vibrations go outward, and your perceptions go outward, you’re not coherent in an inner state. And after pranayama classes for example, and you would be more centered.” (W/01/SY/ANA/02052016/H5P2).

Interviewees have said that yoga has helped them to attain or learn about the true self and that what is critical for them is to be consistent with their true self and to always be in the present moment. Be here now! Interviewee PAT articulates:

What is most important is to be connected with myself. Not to be in the dream or whatever projection whatever, I really want to be in the reality of my reality in the reality (sic) world. That’s the most important thing to be connected with the all. For me it’s essential to be here present! If I am with you here I am in the present. For me what I do here, what I am thinking in two hours! Now, is here! Whatever I do, whatever I feel, I want to be present. And the true self that is most important! (W/03/SY/PAT/14072016/H10P2).

Another informant dedicated himself to meeting the inner teacher which means the true self. The following statement made by Interviewee LEV declares:

“Yes like the true self. You find it in your essence! Peace, great calm. Who are you really! Not the ego, not the identity, not you also, but the outer layer: something much deeper inside all of us. That’s why we say Namaste to each other. That inner light, that inner guru, that inner guide, that essence joins peace and calm and bliss, and very powerful, and when you live from this place, when we do yoga we get closer and closer to that! And more and more we can live from that place. So we live from the heart, we live from our essence, and it translates to everything we do, we’re coming from that place of essence!” (W/01/GY/LEV/13062016/H7P2).

### 4.2 One outcome of yoga practice could be humility.

One outcome of yoga practice could be humility and a loss of ego as stated by Interviewee THI:

“What I learned also is to be more and more humble. So, that’s the most important thing also. To be humble! I think when you are humble; your mind is not imagining things about us. When you are humble the ego is not there.” (W/03/SY/THI/07032016/H15P2). And she additionally revealed her thoughts are not on herself.

Another interviewee TIN demonstrates her humility by stating that despite many years of yoga practice, she sees herself as a novice. She explained:

“Really to be honest, even though I have been practising for twenty years, I so often feel like a beginner. It’s not like, for me anyway, so like I get to a point, like oh I’ve mastered it. I’ve got it. It’s not like that, it’s like ah, it just kind’ve deepens, it gets deeper and I become more aware of things that I wasn’t conscious of before, but it never feels like oh I’ve been doing this for twenty years, I’ve got it, it’s not like that at all!” (W/01/GY/TIN/15072016/H10P6).

In this on-going learning she’s getting a deeper understanding of the essence of yoga.

Interviewee MI brought another perspective of humility by indicating some students of yoga are not to proud to start over again should the situation require it:

They’re the ones that can help, and they’re the ones through the levels of the enlightenment, because they trust themselves. They let their heart guide the way, rather than their mind going crazy saying everything’s destroyed. There’s nothing to work with anymore. They would say well, we are still living, we are still breathing, we’ve still got hands, and we can still do something. And they’re humble enough to start small again. Let’s start at the bottom, let’s start recreating our community. Let’s do this and that, they’re not overwhelmed by what’s happening. They just know where to start, it’s always at the bottom. Where a lot of us when we feel like we’ve reached the level of attainment don’t necessarily want to drop down. We don’t want to accept, and we are angry about it, and being angry about it doesn’t solve it, does it? (W/02/GY/MI/23052016/H19P6).

### 4.3 Yoga brings changes in attitude, Yoga bring how we see life

Interviewee TAN said that for herself a benefit of yoga was that she would have more equanimity as a result of negative events occurring:

I would say that feelings and emotions are part of the experience of yoga. And so over time as yoga as practice, the feelings and emotions shift, higher the feelings and intensity of emotions, or more importantly the relationships to the feelings, I think being human being we’ll always going to have feelings, we always have emotions. And what shifts with yoga if they would find yoga actually, is the relationships to the feelings and emotions would change, there’s less and less reactivity. (W/01/GY/TAN/11082016/H1P5).

In the following statement, the subject indicated how the practice of yoga brought about a transformation in his life. Further, he felt that his personality and level of confidence changed. This particular subject noticed that he was more confident, had more affection, and felt like he was a better person. He had more concern about nature, others, and himself. He even discovered that his diet was affected. Here is Interviewee LEV’s statement:

Ever since then it's transformed me bit by bit. It is a cover eventually I was teaching dance, and then I took a yoga training, and I started teaching yoga, it was natural. After many years of practise, I started finding a deeper sense of self. Like dance helped me find a personality, confident, and all of that, and a sense of self. And then yoga helped me find a deeper sense of self. It transformed me from the inside, instead of just the outside. It started making me a better person, with more compassion, having more love for myself and love for others, more caring, more caring about the environment, caring about what I eat. All these things changed me from the inside out, transformation! (W/01/GY/LEV/13062016/H1P2).

This particular subject experienced an ongoing transformation from her yoga practice. She realized that the causes of her suffering were only occurring in her mind, in what she believed. She has begun to question her thoughts, to question her belief system, and to become conscious of what she is thinking and believing in the moment. Interviewee TIN sums up her process of transformation in this way:

It's like yoga with these really different movements of my body, eventually unpack all of my attachments of my mind. It is like my whole being all gets transformed through that practise and beacons and beacons and more and more. Like it feels never ending, I don't think it has an endpoint. But there's just more and more awareness, that in any moment if I am suffering, the only thing that's creating my suffering is what I am believing. It allows me to question my thoughts, question what I'm believing more and more, and be more aware of what I am thinking or believing in the moment (W/01/GY/TIN/15072016/H9P6).

**Activeness of Students (Flowing and Constant Learning) Yoga is a flowing, continuous process – it cannot be learned in one day. This is a perspective of education and applies to most fields of endeavour. Each class requires the student to be willing to flow with their movements in order to not to hurt themselves.**

Interviewee understands that she needs to be willing to flow with her movements in order to not to hurt herself. Interviewee MI reports, "So I don't just ignore it, try to pretend, try to avoid it completely, I also push into it a bit. A lot of the movements shown in the class today were really deep, I was really stretching my leg out it seems, that was quite painful, but in a way that I can manage, because I can do it in a flowing way where I feel in control and I don't go into fear" (W/02/GY/MI/22042016/H4P2).

"We got meaningful teaching, needed notes, and recording, even documentation towards the methods and lessons tough. When having practices, I have to look at the notes again. (W/03/GY/MICH/01032016/H5P1).

"I have to see my notes again in order that my learning continues. Do not be serious in learning Yoga, do it like playing. If this is done seriously the learning cannot happen" (W/02/GY/MI/22042016/H4P2).

Yoga was perceived not to be considered as enemy, instead, it is only a playing process. Learning can become easy using this philosophy. Interviewee MI continues her explanation about her process of learning yoga, "And then I feel like I am playing this game with the pain, it's not the enemy anymore, it's like we are playing a game, and I am going to smile more. And I'm going to breathe more,

## Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga...

and I'm going to move more. I'm not going to run away from you, we're going to become friends, we are not going to run in opposite directions. Because doing that only feeds it, and it gets worse and worse. Play with it, you need to learn to play, play with the body, don't be serious. Smile don't cry! (W/02/GY/MI/22042016/H4P2).

This interviewee further says that she treats pain as a playmate, not the foe. Her way of dealing with pain is by smiling and working with pain, not avoiding it, not being serious. The process of yoga learning, interviewee IBU reveals, should be done with "constant dedication and also, not every day is the same, meaning not everyday you practise is the same, if I can do something today, maybe I expect to be able to do it in the future, but I might not have the same balance in the future every time. Being - allowing yourself to honouring the fact that it's not always the same, that sometimes it seems like a step backwards but it might not really be a step backwards in the big scheme of thing" (W/01/SY/IBU/25042016/H2P1).

Learning must be continuous and with persevering dedication. She reiterates that even though it may feel like one is going backwards; it really isn't a step backwards in the process of learning. In the process of learning, her yoga teacher suggested that one should not feel weak, not to complain, to confront fear, to go beyond what constrains one, to be diligent in one's yoga practice. He doesn't want his students to be gloomy. Move through it! He says. Asserts interviewee MI,

"So I think it's interesting, separate for Guru and he doesn't allow us to be weak, and he doesn't allow us to feed the weakness in ourselves, he doesn't allow us to feed fear, he doesn't allow us to stay low. He pushes us to rise up through it. Face it! What is it that's blocking you? Face it! If something makes you depressed, clear it! Let go of it, process it, face it and release it. Don't hold it, otherwise you'll never change. If you are not feeling anything, maybe you'll never change anything. Maybe you can do yoga for twenty years and you're still the same! Because they never push themselves at all. (W/02/GY/MI/22042016/H6P2).

Life continuously brings new experiences and yoga is a means to help a person to comprehend it, to be present in the body, and to improve oneself as a person. But interviewee IBU still needs to schedule herself so she can stay on track to learn yoga, "Yes, life is always unfolding new wonders and yoga is a tool to understand it, create awareness, to be in the body, be conscious, and a better person. It's a constant process and reminders are necessary." (D/01/SY/IBU/21042016/H8P2).

The learning process initially seemed to be very difficult. The learners were given target and must have learned according to schedule based on the priority scale. Everyday they have to practice. They have to be committed in the practices. They felt that they had lots of pain when learning Yoga. Yoga teacher taught them to learn every day.

"For example, in my work I go to toilet and sit for five minutes to do healing and connect with the univers" W/03/SY/PHI/05122015/H20P1).

Doing such practices can have impacts to the better *pranayama yoga* to make individual calm. Interviewee TIN explained the results of ongoing yoga practice include increased sensitivity and consciousness. She also exclaims that yoga practice needs to be

continuous, that it is never finished, that new concepts arise, and that just one time is not enough:

I become more sensitive and more aware, and so more things rise to the surface, it's just a deepening of the practise rather than an ending. It means not just doing it one time, and you need to do it constantly. It is like a refining or an achieving of that practise, in every moment of the day. In the beginning it's just in some moments and then it becomes more and more eventually (W/01/GY/TIN/15072016/H10P6).

Yoga is beneficial to the body – that is one of its functions. However it is more helpful if practised over a period of time, once is not enough. It needs to be a continual process. Interviewee LEV emphasizes, “Also the active style even *vinyasa yoga* is aimed at healing the body. That's its actual purpose. But it only really works over the long term. Cannot be one time. One time is good, it will help, but it's a long journey, should be constant education” (W/01/GY/LEV/13062016).

Some of the findings in this research referred to the humanistic learning. Through the constant spirit of learning Yoga learners found their own identity, their heart language, good hearted, and their self transformation themselves. Rogers and Maslow (1968) clearly emphasized on similar psychological approach. Both recognized basic strength of the subjective dimension and self actualiation. The Yoga learning outcomes tended to be: (1) personality forming, (2) humility, (3) changes in attitude, (4) and constant learning.

The personality forming related to the finding of *true self*. This turned out to be related to the finding of psychological research in the mid of the 20th century as the reaction of behaviorism and psychoanalysis. Maslow (1968) criticized Freud that “half of healthy the individual psychology must fill the other half of unhealthy psychology”. In fact, it was found out that people could even live in suffering life (Zohar and Marshall, 2007:xiii). There also was found out that there were happy people in certain situation and condition and also being happy in any condition.

The humanistic philosophy views dignity and autonomy as the most important principles. Humanism concerns the individual development holistically with special attention to effective dimension of personality. Moedzakir (2010:103) said that finally human beings must realize their responsibilities to achieve their dream and be aware of their own strengths. Such understanding provide the essence of the awareness building within the individual believe holistically. This turned out to be developing humanistic personality. It was significantly showed the outcomes of the Yoga learning.

In more intensive way Scher (2016) describes that there should be strategies and perspective bringing the humanistic views within the dignity. “Furthermore, shows how to get messages from the subconscious mind, transform unhealthy emotional patterns, and keep moving ahead. Mackey promotes getting beyond the debilitating mind-sets of accepting defeat, seeing oneself as a victim, and fearing illness, and posits alternative ways of thinking in terms of new strategies and practices.” Newman (2015:98) described dignity as “The concept of a “true self” is the concept people employ when they speak of “being true to yourself” or “revealing the person you really are, deep down inside.” Though intellectuals of various stripes have claimed that this whole notion is a mistaken or incoherent one (Foucault, 1984; Sartre, 1958/2003), empirical research consistently finds that people's ordinary understanding of the mind does involve a distinction between

## Learning Outcomes Through The Tourist Yoga...

a “true self” (sometimes referred to as a person’s “core” or “essence”) and more superficial aspects of the self (sometimes known collectively as the “false self”; Johnson, Robinson, & Mitchell, 2004”.

Newman (2015:123) examined four apparently independent asymmetries and suggested that all four could be explained in terms of the same underlying psychological process, namely, attributions of a “true self.” Future work in this area could seek greater breadth (by looking for yet further asymmetries driven by the same process) or greater depth (by trying to explain why people understand the true self in the way they do). Regardless of the precise form it takes, however, such work can proceed by examining these asymmetries not as four separate and unrelated effects, but as four symptoms of a single unified phenomenon: the tendency to assume that, deep down, others are morally good.

It can be concluded that by learning Yoga, people can find their own dignity. Introspection revealed the human existence as creature to find the personal quality. Outcomes of the Yoga learning were able to guide individuals come to the beautiful point in the achievement of all creatures in the univers. Individuals need to learn to involve themselves in the truth world of their own, but not being selfish and egoistic. Learning inside is the introspection and a process of transformation to find their own dignity and the position in the univers. When they are coherent and become exist as well as committed at the present situation as guided by Yoga, they can meet their actual characters, actual dignity. Or “self ilahi”.

The third finding of the Yoga learning showed that the tourists found their own humility attitude. Brahma Kumaris (2000:37) humility is a basis for things to happen on; a carefulness and simple being to create from. For it there is no expectation of brilliance and therefore accomplishment come more naturally, untreatened by what will be said or thought by others. A humble person is lovely to be with, for beside them one is at ones best and yet because they respect themselves, nothing done betittles them, but further speaks of their beauty because the achievement is half theirs already. Stickney (2010:77), on the other hand, said that humility in its cultural forms, ‘unpretentiousness’ and ‘respect,’ is something we recognize and discern from a range of less noble instances: cases such as ‘shyness’ or ‘servility,’ even if we cannot teach others to see it or articulate precisely its boundaries.

Sapmaz (2016:43) identified another concept related to subjective well-being was humility. Humility was examined with the openness, self-forgetfulness, focus on others, and modest self-assessment sub dimensions. Humility is a frequent topic in the literature, however there is little research about its relationship with subjective well-being. This research also investigated humility without considering sub dimensions (Alpay, 2009; Sarıçam et al., 2012). It was evidenced that with the Yoga spiritual way, people can result good hearted and recognize the greatness of God. The Yoga learners became aware and humble.

The fourth finding of this research showed the existence of attitude changes or personal transformation or it could be called transformative learning (Cranton, 2003). Moedzakir (2010:127) said that transformative learning is strategized into: (1) An activating event that typically exposes a discrepancy between what person has always assumed to be true and what just been experienced, heard, or read. (2) Articulating assumptions, that is,

recognizing underlying assumptions that have been uncritically assimilated and are largely unconscious. (3) Critical self-reflection that questioning and examining assumptions in term of where they come from, the consequence of holding them, and why they are important. (4) Being open to alternative viewpoint. (5) Engaging in discourse, where evidence is weighed, arguments assessed, alternative perspective explored, and knowledge constructed by consensus. (6) Revising assumptions and perspective to make them more open and better justified. (7). Acting on revision, behaving, talking, and thinking in way that is congruent with tranformed assumptions or perspective.

Gunnlaugson (2008) at the further development of *transformative learning* said that the adult learning perspective changes from integration in various fractions into holistic perspective. Such evolution related to emotional, spiritual, relational processes, art based learning, and *story telling*. All of them make transformation in more selective way. Cox and John (2016:308) A further critique from Newman (1994) argues that Mezirow prioritized individual transformation over social change. To this, Mezirow (1997a: 62) responded that “dichotomizing individual and society seems to be counter-productive in trying to understand the learning process. Learning is a social process, but it takes place in the individual.”

It can be concluded that Outcomes of Yoga learning revealed self transformation or shifting. This can be understood as the basic attitude changed from the status of ignorance or sufferings to the enlightenment of life.

The last findings of this research as the constant learning. This suits to the statement of Carl A. Roger on the *On Becoming a Person*. Roger (1961:122) concludes the uniqueness of individuals and that flows in education as follos: “A person is a stream of becoming, not a finished product... a fluid process, not a fixed and static entity; a flowing river of change, not block of solid material; a continually changing constellation of potentialities, not a fixed quantity of traits”. Human beings possess big potential to change their life into the better direction.

This Yoga learning outcomes synchronizes to the statement of Ginanjar (2001:vii) that the process of meaningful life discovery is basically the discovery of finding the personal dignity and a part of the human education. Therefore, it is not enough to develop people on their on intellectuality, but also the ability to be humanistic. Eventhough materials and social position can be considered as the measures of success, human beings still need spiritual dimention.

It can be concluded that the practices of Yoha can be done continuously and can fli in the life of learners. Learning must be done constantly.

### Conclusion

This research concluded that outcomes of Yoga learninf in the tourism area of Ubud Bali, could brings to the understanding of self dignity, the state of becoming god hearted, the ability to conduct self-transformation, and the ability to cinduct constant learning as the essence of *continuing education*.

### References

Aloni, Nimrod. 2013. *Empowering Dialogues in Humanistic Education Educational Philosophy and Theory*, Vol. 45, No. 10, 1067–1081, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469->

- 5812.2011.00789.x. Institute for Progressive Education at Kibbutzim College of Education.
- Apps, J.W.** 1979. *Problem in Continuing Education*. USA: McGRAW-HILL BOOK COMPANY.
- Barbour, Ian G.** 2002. *Juru Bicara Tuhan: Antara Sains dan Agama*. Bandung: PT. Mizan.
- Berry, Rita S. Y.** 1999. *Collecting data by in-depth interviewing* University of Exeter & Hong Kong Institute of Education.
- Brahma Kumaris.** 2000. *The Word of Peacefull*.
- Boyce, Carolyn and Palena Neale.** 2006. *Conducting In-Depth Interviews: A Guide for Designing and Conducting In-Depth Interviews for Evaluation Input*. Pathfinder International. Monitoring and Evaluation (2).
- Cohen, E.** 1979. *A phenomenology of tourism experiences*. Sociology, 13, 2, 179-201.
- Cox, Amanda J. and Vaughn M. John 2016. Adult Education Quarterly. Transformative Learning in Postapartheid South Africa: Disruption, Dilemma, and Direction 2016, Vol. 66(4) 303–318. aeq.sagepub.com.
- Cramer, Holger (et all).** 2014. Characteristics of randomized controlled trials of yoga: a bibliometric analysis *Cramer et al. BMC Complementary and Alternative Medicine 2014, 14:328* (Online) (<http://www.biomedcentral.com/1472-6882/14/328>), diakses 23 September 2015.
- Creswell, John W.** 1998. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*. Sage Publications.
- Edward, A. And Talbot, R. 1994. *The Hard Press Researcher*. London: Long-man.
- Faisal, S. 1995, *Merancang Penyelenggaraan Penelitian Kualitatif*, Malang: Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan.
- Fatchan, Ach.** 2013. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif 10 Langkah Penelitian Kualitatif Pendekatan Konstruksi dan Fenomenologi*. Malang: Penerbit Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Fonseca, Daniel & Jeenal Mehta, 2012, *Thinking Of Training To Become A Yoga Teacher?* (Online), (<http://www.southeastasiabackpacker.com/thinking-of-training-to-become-a-yoga-teacher/>), diakses 19 September 2015.
- Frankl, Victor E.** 1963. *Man's Search for Meaning*, New York: Beacon.
- Freire, Paulo.** 1973. *Education for Social Consciousness*. New York: Seabury.
- Ginanjar, Agustian Ary.** 2010. *Rahasia Sukses Membangun Kecerdasan Emosi dan Spiritual ESQ Berdasarkan Rukun Iman dan 5 Rukun Islam*. Jakarta: Arga Wijaya Persada.
- Hanurawan, Fattah.** 2010. *Psikologi Sosial Suatu Pengantar*. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Holladay, Patrick J and Lauren M. Ponder, Lauren M.** 2012. *Identification-of-self through a yoga-travel-spirit nexus akademisk*. [www.akademiskkvarter.hum.aau.dk/](http://www.akademiskkvarter.hum.aau.dk/). Volume 04. Spring 2012. diakses 9 September 2015.
- Huberman, A.M., dan Miles, Matthew, B.** 1994. *Data Management and Analysis Methods*, Handbooks of Qualitative Research. Norman K, Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln (Ed). Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Jung, C.G.** 1933. *Modern Man in Search of a Soul*. E.T.
- Magee, Bryan.** 2008. *The Story Of Philosophy, Kisah Tentang Filsafat*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Kanisius.
- Mezirow, J.** 2000. *Learning as Transformation: Critical Perspective on a Theory in Progress*. San Fransisco. CA: Jossey Bass.
- Moedzakir, Djauzi.** 2007. *5 Macam Tradisi Penelitian Kualitatif* Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.

- Moedzakir, Djauzi. 2010.** *Metode Pembelajaran Untuk Program-Program Pendidikan Luar Sekolah*. Malang: Universitas Negeri Malang.
- Moedzakir, Djauzi. 2014.** *Pembelajaran Transformatif*. Malang. PT. Elang Emas.
- Moscal, R. 1999.** *Reflexivity in Social Life and Sociological Practice: A Rejoinder to Roger Slack*. Sociological Research Online.
- Newman, George E. 2015.** *Beliefs About the True Self Explain Asymmetries Based on Moral Judgment*. (Online) Cognitive Science 39 (2015) 96–125 Copyright © 2014 Cognitive Science Society, Inc. All rights reserved. ISSN: 0364-0213 print / 1551-6709.
- Nimrod Aloni 2013.** (Empowering Dialogues in Humanistic Education) Educational Philosophy and Theory, 2013 Vol. 45, No. 10, 1067–1081, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-5812.2011.00789.x>.
- Patton, Michael Q. 2002.** *Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Pitana, I Gde dan Putu G. Gayatri. 2005.** *Sosiologi Pariwisata*. Yogyakarta, Penerbit: Andi Offset.
- Prairie Research Associates, Inc. 2001.** The In-Depth Interview. Prairie Research Associates, Inc. (TechNotes). Available at <http://www.pra.ca/resources/indepth.pdf>.
- Radhakrisnan, S. 2003.** *Religion and Society*. Denpasar: Program Magister Ilmu Agama Dan Kebudayaan Universitas Hindu Indonesia Indonesia bekerjasama dengan Widya Dharma.
- Ratz, T., Michalko, G., & Kovacs, B. 2008.** The influence of Lake Balaton's tourist milieu on visitors' quality of life. *Tourism*, 56, 2, 127-142.
- Reymond, Manuela du Bois. 2003.** *Study on the links between formal and non-formal education*. Centre for Youth Studies, Leiden University (Netherlands).
- Ritzer, George. 2004.** *Sosiologi Ilmu Pengetahuan Berparadigma Ganda*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Roger, Carl. R. 1961.** *On Becoming a Person*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.
- Sapmaz, Fatma. 2016.** Gratitude, Forgiveness and Humility as Predictors of Subjective Well-being among University Students International Online Journal of Educational Sciences, 2016, 8 (1), 38 – 47.
- Scher, Amy B. 2016.** *How To Heal Yourself When No One Else Can: A Total Self-Healing Approach for Mind, Body, and Spirit*. Llewellyn
- Sharpley, R. & Jepsen, D. 2010.** Rural tourism: a spiritual experience? *Annals of Tourism Research*, 38, pp. 52-71.
- Stickney, Jeff. 2010** Reconciling forms of Asian humility with assessment practices and character education programs in North America, *Ethics and Education* Vol. 5, No. 1, March 2010, 67–80 University of Toronto, Toronto, Canada.
- Sukidi, 2000.** *Spiritualitas "New Age"* (Online), (<http://www.sarapanpagi.org/spiritualitas-new-age-vt431.html>), diakses 13 September 2015.
- Wilson, G. B. 2008.** Conceptualizing spirituality in the context of tourism. In: The 2nd International Colloquium on Tourism and Leisure. Chiang Mai, Thailand. May 5-8 2008.
- Wilson, G. B. 2010.** Exploring travel and spirituality: the role of travel in facilitating life purpose and meaning within the lives of individuals. Ph. D. University of Waikato.
- Zohar, Danah dan Ian Marshall. 2007.** *SQ: Kecerdasan Spiritual, cetakan XI*. Bandung: PT. Mizan Pustaka.